

<b>Agenda Item</b> A8	<b>Committee Date</b> 23 July 2018	<b>Application Number</b> 18/00543/LB
<b>Application Site</b>  St Thomas Church Penny Street Lancaster Lancashire		<b>Proposal</b>  Listed building application for a single-storey glazed extension to connect the former choir vestry of the church and the proposed replacement Church Centre building, alterations to the former choir vestry including the removal of an existing timber door and replacement with timber-framed partition and the removal of arched windows to the south elevation and replacement with fire escape door, installation of new perimeter security gates adjoining the Penny Street and Marton Street elevations, and alterations to the boundary wall to Victoria Place including the addition of a wrought iron railings
<b>Name of Applicant</b>  Mr Tim Parsons		<b>Name of Agent</b>  Northmill Associates
<b>Decision Target Date</b>  Extension of time until 25 July 2018		<b>Reason For Delay</b>  Committee Cycle
<b>Case Officer</b>		Mrs Eleanor Fawcett
<b>Departure</b>		No
<b>Summary of Recommendation</b>		Approval, subject to amendments to the gates and fencing.

## **1.0 The Site and its Surroundings**

- 1.1 The application site is within the centre of Lancaster and relates to St Thomas' Church Centre, the associated land surrounding this, and St Thomas's Church. The church centre is two storey, finished in a mix of stone and render, and fronts onto Marton Street, with the building abutting the rear of the pavement. It also adjoins Victoria Place at the rear, which is at a higher level than the ground floor of the building. The boundary wall enclosing the land to the west of the centre lies adjacent to Peter Street.
- 1.2 The church lies to the west of the church centre building and is separated by a paved area and steps which provides access from Marton Street to both buildings and Victoria Place via some steps. St Thomas's Church is Grade II Listed and is set back slightly from Marton Street and fronts onto Penny Street. It is enclosed by walls and railings which are separately Listed (Grade II). To the east of the site, adjacent to Peter Street, is a row of two storey stone properties which front onto Thurnham Street and Marton Street and comprise a mix of commercial and residential uses. To the north is the Police Station and to the south is a garage building between Victoria Place and the carpark. The site is located within the Lancaster Conservation Area and is just outside the Lancaster Air Quality Management Area.

## **2.0 The Proposal**

- 2.1 Listed Building Consent is sought for a single-storey glazed extension to connect the former choir vestry of the church to a new church centre building to replace the existing one at the site.

Alterations to the church to facilitate this include alterations to the former choir vestry including the removal of an existing timber door and replacement with timber-framed partition and the removal of arched windows to the south elevation and replacement with a fire escape door. The proposed church hall will be on a similar footprint to the existing building but will be oriented with the roofslope facing Marton Street and will have a large gable projection at the rear. A large single storey lean-to is proposed on the east elevation, which will extend into the existing external space to the east, up to a new footway which is proposed adjacent to Peter Street. A smaller lean-to is proposed on the west elevation to provide a lobby to the new building, and this will be linked to St Thomas's church, towards the southern part of the east elevation, with a glazed link. The proposal also includes the installation of some metal gates and railings to adjoin to the existing boundary walls of the church.

### **3.0 Site History**

3.1 The most relevant site history is set out below.

Application Number	Proposal	Decision
<b>18/00405/FUL</b>	Relevant Demolition of existing 2 storey Church Centre building and erection of a replacement 2.5 storey Church Centre building, including single storey lean-to and single storey link to the adjacent Church and alterations to existing carpark, including creation of steps and resurfacing	Under Consideration
<b>16/01486/PRETWO</b>	Pre-application advice in relation to the erection of a replacement 2.5 storey Church centre	Advice Provided.

### **4.0 Consultation Responses**

4.1 The following responses have been received from statutory and non-statutory consultees:

Consultee	Response
<b>Conservation Team</b>	<b>Support</b> , subject to conditions. The proposal would lead to total loss of a Non-Designated Heritage Asset, which would harm the significance of the building. The proposed demolition would also cause harm to the significance of Lancaster Conservation Area and the adjacent Listed Building. This harm is considered to be less than substantial, but there are significant public benefits which could outweigh the harm.

### **5.0 Neighbour Representations**

5.1 No representations have been received.

### **6.0 Principal National and Development Plan Policies**

#### **6.1 National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)**

Paragraphs 7, 14 and 17 – Sustainable Development and Core Principles  
Paragraphs 131 – 134, 137 and 141 – Designated Heritage Assets

#### **6.2 Local Planning Policy Overview – Current Position**

At the 20 December 2017 meeting of its Full Council, the local authority resolved to publish the following 2 Development Plan Documents (DPD) for submission to the Planning Inspectorate:

- (i) The Strategic Policies and Land Allocations DPD; and,
- (ii) A Review of the Development Management DPD.

This enables progress to be made on the preparation of a Local Plan for the Lancaster District. The DPDs were published on the 9 February for an 8 week consultation in preparation for submission to the Planning Inspectorate for independent Examination. If an Inspector finds that the submitted DPDs have been soundly prepared they may be adopted by the Council, potentially in late 2018.

The **Strategic Policies and Land Allocations DPD** will replace the remaining policies of the Lancaster District Core Strategy (2008) and the residual 'saved' land allocation policies from the 2004 District Local Plan. Following the Council resolution in December 2017, it is considered that the Strategic Policies and Land Allocations DPD is a material consideration in decision-making, although with limited weight. The weight attributed to this DPD will increase as the plan's preparation progresses through the stages described above.

The **Review of the Development Management DPD** updates the policies that are contained within the current document, which was adopted in December 2014. As it is part of the development plan the current document is already material in terms of decision-making. Where any policies in the draft 'Review' document are different from those adopted in 2014, and those policies materially affect the consideration of the planning application, then these will be taken into account during decision-making, although again with limited weight. The weight attributed to the revised policies in the 'Review' will increase as the plan's preparation progresses through the stages described above.

### 6.3 Development Management Development Plan Document

DM30 – Development affecting Listed Buildings

### 6.4 Other Material Considerations

Section 66 of The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended states that the local planning authority shall have regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

## **7.0 Comment and Analysis**

7.1 The main issues to be considered in the determination of this application are:

- Impact on the Listed Buildings

7.2 Impact on the Listed Buildings

7.2.1 The proposal relates to extensions and alterations to the Grade II Listed St Thomas' Church, and separately listed walls and railings, associated with a replacement church centre adjacent to the Church. The church dates from 1840-41 and was designed by Edmund Sharpe with a later chancel and steeple added 1852-53 by Sharpe and Paley. The church centre will be over three floors and main part of this will be on a similar footprint to the existing building but will be oriented with the roofslope facing Marton Street, with a large gable projection at the rear. The front part of the building will be approximately 1.3 metres higher than the existing building. A large single storey lean-to is proposed on the east elevation, which will extend into the existing external space to the east, up to a new footway which is proposed adjacent to Peter Street. A smaller lean-to is proposed on the west elevation to provide a lobby to the new building, and this will be linked to St Thomas's Church with a glazed link. The front section of the building is proposed to be finished in a mix of reclaimed stone from the existing building and ashlar stone, with elements of dark grey cladding providing framing to windows. The rear projection would be finished in a through coloured render and the roof would be slate.

7.2.2 The large single storey lean-to on the eastern elevation is proposed to be a mix of reclaimed stone, grey cladding and glazing. It was originally proposed to have a sloping slate roof, however there were concerns regarding the appearance of this, given its depth, as it did not appear as an integral part of the design for the whole building. As such, the sloping section has been shortened, introducing a flat roofed element and this would have a grey Glass Reinforced Plastic (GRP) roof with a lead roll effect. A smaller lean-to is proposed on the west elevation which would be mostly glazed and have a sloping roof, similar to the other lean-to but with a large amount of glazing. This would encroach into the area which separates the current building from the church. From this is proposed a glazed link to the church which would mostly have a flat GRP roof, with the exception of a small section which would be glazed and attach to the listed building. The glazing would be set into the wall of the church.

7.2.3 The proposed massing and scale relates well to the surrounding built form and will still retain the listed church's prominence in the streetscene. The design draws influence from the church with the

use of a pitched roof, oriented with the roofslope facing the highway, with coping stones and verticality of windows, but incorporating a modern approach. The re-use of the stone from the existing building, with ashlar above in addition to the slate roof is considered to be appropriate within the historic context. It is considered that the more modern materials, including the cladding and the GRP roof, will provide a contemporary appearance whilst not detracting from the character and appearance listed church and associated wall and railings, which are separately listed. The alterations to the lean-to are an improvement to the scheme. Whilst the footprint has remained largely the same, the reconfiguration of the lean-to roof has reduced the visual dominance of this feature which was a concern with the original proposal. A more simplified surround to the first floor windows in the gable facing Peter Street elevation has also been proposed which provides cleaner lines, more in keeping with the overall design concept.

- 7.2.4 As set out above, the building will attach to the listed church via a glazed link. This will be in the form of a short length of frameless glass surround to the arched doorway of the choir vestry. This connection is proposed to be sawcut into the existing structure and held in place by a polysulphide sealant. A lead flashing would be proposed over the existing hood mould to maintain a weather proof seal. This is considered to have a minimal impact both visually and physically upon the listed building and is considered to be an appropriate solution to link the new building to the church. The submission sets out that the present timber doorway into the vestry is rotten and is to be replaced by a timber framed insulated partition with plaster finish. This will render the doorway redundant, its historic purpose will still remain legible. However, this does raise the question of the need for the physical link if there will be no through route between the centre and the church and this has been queried with the agent. On the south elevation of the vestry are two two-light arched windows, the right one to be replaced by an aluminium framed powder-coated fire escape door to an external terrace area. The vestry is a later addition, added on map evidence between 1938 and 1957. As such, it is considered that the proposal will not be detrimental to the significance of the building.
- 7.2.5 Concerns have been raised with the agent in relation to the design of the proposed new railings and gates which have been proposed between the side of the church and Victoria Place, between the church and Marton Street, and between the wall abutting Victoria Place and the new building. Given that the railings and walls around the church are separately Grade II listed and were designated separately for their ornate design and association with Edmund Sharpe, there are concerns that the proposed design of railings would diminish this architectural interest. In addition, they will be projecting above the boundary wall which is considered to be inappropriate. It was advised that the gates immediately adjacent to the church (marked as A and B) were removed from the proposal or significantly redesigned to be more sympathetic to the surrounding architectural detail and character. Following these concerns being raised, amended details have been provided. Whilst the design does copy the finial detail, they are not a particularly sympathetic addition as the piers have a square profile. In addition, it appears that the height of one of these (marked as A) has been increased, so that it projects above the wall which bounds Victoria Place. The design of this is considered to be inappropriate and the agent has been advised that the details should be amended to better reflect the detail of the historic gates and fences the church.
- 7.2.6 Subject to the resolution of the concerns with regards to the gates and railings, and clarification with regards to the purpose of the glazed link, the proposed development is considered to be acceptable in terms of its scale, siting and design and will not have a detrimental impact on the significance of the listed church and associated walls and railings.

## **8.0 Planning Obligations**

- 8.1 There are no planning obligations to consider as part of this proposal.

## **9.0 Conclusions**

- 9.1 Subject to the resolution of the concerns with regards to the gates and railings, and clarification with regards to the purpose of the glazed ink, the proposed development is considered to be acceptable in terms of its scale, siting and design and will not a detrimental impact on the significance of the listed church and associated walls and railings.

### **Recommendation**

That Listed Building Consent **BE GRANTED** subject to amendments to the gates and fencing and the following conditions:

1. Standard listed building timescale
2. Approved plans
3. Materials/details including – stone; render; roofing materials; cladding; eaves verge and ridge details; rooflights; flues and vents; gates and fencing to churchyard; windows and doors; window surrounds; barrier to car park; louvres; glazed extension to church.

### **Background Papers**

None